



June 12, 2024

MEMORANDUM

TO: Market Transformation Advisory Board

FROM: Clarissa Kusel, Program Manager
 Hope Lobkowitz, Market Research Evaluation Lead for Consumer Products
 Elaine Miller, Senior Manager, Market Transformation Strategy

SUBJECT: Chefluencer Pilot Feedback Memo

CalMTA would like to thank both the Market Transformation Advisory Board (MTAB) and the public for the feedback provided on the Induction Cooking Chefluencer Strategy Pilot. The draft Strategy Pilot statement of work (SOW) was posted for comment on the California Public Utilities Commission's (CPUC) [Public Document Area \(PDA\) website](#) from May 22 - June 5, 2024. During the comment period we received four responses. Below is a summary of the feedback and CalMTA’s responses. When appropriate, we have updated the Program Strategy Pilot SOW. Final documents can be found in our website’s reports section: <https://calmta.org/resources-and-reports/>.

Table 1: Chefluencer Strategy Pilot Feedback

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
Julia Hatton - Rising Sun Center for Opportunity	1	Give away single-burner induction plug in products to participants as a step towards trying induction	I'd be interested in seeing what role portable induction cooktops (single-burner) could play in reducing technology barriers to full induction cooktops and range replacement. Rising Sun Center for Opportunity (www.risingsunopp.org) ran a pilot program within our direct install energy efficiency program that provided low-	This is a good idea and the team will consider this with the retailers and BDC as an alternative and in addition to the current incentive.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			<p>income customers with a free portable cooktop, through funding support from Ava Community Energy. Our experience is that stove replacement is one of the more significant cultural and emotional barriers to electrification, and that portable cooktops can be an inexpensive way to introduce the technology and allow customers to experiment with it before asking them to get rid of their gas stoves entirely. Funding and partnering with local, community-based organizations that interact directly with households (especially those focused on public health/indoor air quality and/or energy efficiency) could be a way to work through trusted entities.</p>	
The Energy Coalition	2	Give away single-burner induction plug in products to participants as a step towards trying induction	<p>We applaud the Chefluencers Strategy Pilot effort to assess the value of messages around the benefits of induction cooking, the effect of coupons, and the engagement and knowledge of retailers and manufacturers, and we recognize these current barriers to induction cooking adoption. We offer the following suggestions on the plan: - We suggest the project include giving away (or raffling off) 120V single or double</p>	Please see above answer to #1.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			portable cook plates. This will provide an opportunity for people to test out their own favorite recipes at home before going all in on a purchase. We noticed that another commenter elaborated on this as well.	
The Energy Coalition	3	Showcase safety and cooking benefits of induction cooking	We suggest the project consider measuring temperature on and around the cooking area, to showcase the absence of waste heat (and added safety for children) - these could be strong influencing factors, especially during summer demo sessions.	We agree that these are likely strong influencing factors for some consumers. We will ensure that these are included in the demonstrations.
The Energy Coalition	4	Reaching renters and the barriers they face	We note that the proposed approach is likely to only reach owners, as few renters have agency / responsibility for purchasing their stove. However, renters can choose to change much of their cooking to electric, through a combination of small appliances including 120V portable induction cook plates. Further, the lowest income strata of households tends to be predominantly renters, and these renter households are smaller and less likely to have good kitchen ventilation, resulting in higher concentrations of NO2 when cooking with methane gas. If these Cheflencer events could somehow support retail sales of portable	We agree that the majority of likely participants will be homeowners who have more agency to purchase their ranges. This is another good reason to consider a raffle or some sort of giveaway for single-burner plug-in products and we will consider this with our retail and BDC partners. We can also gather data from the participants to capture how many of them are, in fact, renters to learn more about typical consumers walking into these stores. This will be helpful information if this MTI reaches the full deployment stage to better understand

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			induction cooking units for renters, in addition to built-in cooktops / full range units, this would improve the equity aspect of the proposed project. Thank you for the opportunity to comment and we look forward to seeing the results of this pilot.	how to help renters make the transition to induction cooking.
MTAB (Randall Higa)	5	Public opinion within retail environment	“Can Chefluencer events change public opinion.” We know that in-store demos are effective, and are already in widespread use by manufacturers. Is there something unique about Chefluencer events that deviates from the in-store demo model used by manufacturers?	We know that these events can be effective, but we have not seen these events executed in big box and local chain retail stores where over 70% of appliances are sold. We feel this is an important channel to test the Chefluencer approach to learn both about consumer response but also, retailer response and their appetite for future collaboration. If there is additional data available on events like this in the retail environment and manufacturer participation, we would welcome reviewing.
MTAB (Randall Higa)	6	Loaning Induction Stovetops	The recent comment on the webinar just now about the coupon for a plug in or countertop unit, why not have the Induction Lending program info there, so they can borrow a unit instead of purchasing a unit. There is a list of the loaner programs on the BDC site. But	This is a good idea and CalMTA will investigate having the appropriate information on individual loaner programs mapped to the right store locations.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			SCE and PGE have a robust program for this.	
MTAB (Randall Higa)	7	Benefits of induction cooking impact on retail customers	<p>“Which messages regarding the benefits on induction cooking resonate the most with retail customers?” The objective of “confirming messaging” seems possibly duplicative and perhaps unnecessary: BDC’s Chefluencer program teaches chefs to communicate the benefits of induction and seems to be a mature program with messaging already developed. Do you have any baseline data on how messaging already used by BDC’s Chefluencer is received by an audience? Or, if BDC doesn’t have such data, are you proposing to evaluate BDC’s messaging? Are you testing new messaging? If so, do you have a baseline against which any new messaging might be assessed?</p> <p>The pilot is also structured so that the objective of “confirming messaging” seems to be opportunistic, with very little ability to control which customer segments actually attend events and thus provide data about messaging effectiveness. Can the sample design</p>	<p>We agree with the comment that the presence of existing data on this topic is worth investigating further and would be valuable to obtain, but still feel the Strategy Pilot, which will reach retail staff and a range of consumer types shopping in a retail environment, will offer us a unique opportunity to explore the value proposition of induction and the salience of specific benefits or features among shoppers. We will leverage any data that BDC has on messages/values/benefits of induction. We can compare and contrast to this pilot but would not consider it “baseline” data. The survey will ask participants at the event about their impressions of induction cooktops prior to the event and after.</p> <p>We do not have the ability to control the segments of the general population that attend the events or to target particular customer segments. The study results will be from a convenience sample of consumers who attend an event and choose to take part in the survey. Though there are limitations to this</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			<p>include more details on which customer segments will be targeted, and how many survey “completes” will be delivered in each customer segment? Creating a sample design and controlling the number of samples per segment will allow CalMTA to conduct statistical significance testing on the effectiveness of messaging across different segments.</p> <p>If scaled up to a full MT intervention, does the CalMTA intend to offer Chefluencer events at retailers across the state? Should the pilot be conducted across a range of communities, and not just retailers in underserved communities? As currently planned, data from this pilot may not support a decision to scale this intervention across the state.</p>	<p>design, we believe it will offer critical information for the development of the MTI Plan: namely, it will deliver directional insights on whether retail in-person demonstration events are a viable approach to improving awareness and perceptions of induction cooktops and impacting purchasing decisions.</p> <p>We are planning on a minimum of 150 responses. Where the sample sizes allow, we will conduct cross tabulation of results to explore relationships, but message testing among specific demographics is not an objective of the pilot due to the desire to be open to the public, the moderately small number of events, and timeline.</p> <p>Yes, if this is successful and found to be effective, this may be scaled to retailers across the state. As currently scoped, the pilot is not only targeting underserved communities. With our retailer partners and BDC, we will choose a mix of stores in three areas across the state that serve all customers.</p> <p>When considering the Strategy Pilot findings in the context of other research</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
				<p>we are conducting in 2024, we believe we will have enough experience and learnings to decide about a possible scaled intervention that targets changing public opinions through the retail channel. We will combine the Strategy Pilot learnings with BDC's experience and findings from CalMTA's market characterization research that is gathering information through consumer focus groups and other research tactics.</p>
	8	Incentive motivation and incentive design	<p>"Are participants motivated to purchase induction technology if the event is coupled with a coupon for the purchase of a product?" How does a \$500 coupon fit into a market transformation initiative, when one objective of MT is to reduce customer dependence on incentives? We suggest that your testing of the messaging be done separately from the testing of the \$500 coupon, as the effectiveness of the messaging may affect the customer interest in the coupon. We also suggest that you might vary the value of the coupon, say, between \$100 to \$500 in \$100 increases, to understand the degree to which an additional \$100 would drive redemption. This information would be</p>	<p>The conceptual logic model for induction includes the barrier of high entry costs. This is a large barrier but one that may change over the life of the MTI. At this stage, this coupon may help us better understand an entry cost target for early in the program's implementation. In addition, output from this pilot may inform utility RA programs and future manufacturer/retail promotions. We do predict that once customers understand and value induction cooking, coupled with likely manufacturer competitive price declines, consumer-facing incentives will not be needed in the long term.</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			critical to ensuring that ratepayer dollars are used for maximum benefit-to-cost.	This is an interesting idea to test price/incentive responsiveness and one the team has considered. Our major limitation is the number of events the Strategy Pilot plans to complete in the limited timeframe. With an assumed sample size of 150 coupon recipients, we will not be able to detect significant differences in purchasing decisions across so many incentive levels. It's possible we could explore two levels, but whether the analysis would be able to glean meaningful purchase differences between the two coupons is difficult to predict. Detecting statistically different results between the two will be dependent on how many people actually redeem the coupons, and the timeframe in which they do so may not be fast enough to utilize any learnings from this analysis for the MTI Plan.
MTAB (Randall Higa)	9	Retail & manufacturer response	"How does the retailer and their target product manufacturer support and react to these kinds of events?" The plan states that CalMTA will measure whether participation in these events "raises the possibility of a change in retailer stocking practices..." Can you say more about how you will measure this change in possibility? The tools for	The assessment task currently includes a survey with retail sales associates and store managers to inquire about experience with the event and plans to change stocking or displays. This will be a qualitative approach. The team will discuss the option of pre-and-post data gathering on models stocked/displayed in the store, and whether a longer-term

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			<p>measuring this possibility range from the short-term and vague survey question (e.g. "Is there a chance you will increase your stocking of induction models, yes or no?") to a more rigorous longer term assessment of actual stocking practices at, say, 3-month intervals for 1 year after these events. It might be worth assessing long-term stocking practices as a function of whether Chefluencer events continue to be held regularly at a retailer. CalMTA will need to get the baseline data from stocking practices prior to the event, of course.</p>	<p>approach is viable, beyond the end of the pilot.</p> <p>In addition, we are building longer term relationships with retailers both through this pilot and the broader ESRPP pilot. If this MTI moves to Phase III, we will have the relationships and data mechanisms in place to be able to track this over time, as would be needed for a full MTI.</p>
	10	Chefluencer events educate retail sales associates	<p>"Do these events help retail sales associates improve their knowledge about induction for more effective retail sales?" How many retail sales associates (assigned to the appliance department) do you expect to reach at the two to three stores participating in the pilot, about 10 per store? Will this be enough data to support statistical analysis so that we know whether their results can generalize to all retailers in the state? Will there be a plan, such as developing a new employee training session in place to address the high turn-over rates? There are more rigorous methods</p>	<p>We do not expect to be able to conduct statistical analysis with the retail staff surveys due to the small sample size and would not expect to be able to generalize the results to the population of store sales associates across the state. Store associate participation in the events will vary by each location and be at the discretion of each store manager, but we conservatively do not want to plan for more than two staff at any event.</p> <p>We do expect to be able to determine whether the Chefluencer events improved knowledge about the benefits</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			<p>than pre- and post-participation self-report survey, which is subject to social desirability effects. We suggest creating a short test to be offered in addition to self-reports of knowledge increase, to better understand how much of their knowledge can be attributed to Chefluencer event, as compared with training from materials that manufacturers regularly provide to aid all retail staff.</p> <p>Overall, it's not clear if the data from this pilot is sufficient for informing whether the pilot can be scaled up as a statewide intervention. The Induction Ranges and Cooktops MT Advancement Plan only budgets for one Strategy Pilot (the ESRPP retail pilot, at \$600,000). Can the CalMTA please include information on how the Chefluencer pilot will be funded? Because the Advancement Plan budget did not include this pilot, we are given the impression that this is the only pilot that will inform any MTI application that includes in store events. As such, it's critical that CalMTA rigorously defines what data are needed in order to generalize findings across the state.</p>	<p>and features of induction cooking, and helped to overcome biases pertaining to fuel type through self-report surveys. From the team's preliminary research and secret shopping visits among retail locations in California, bias toward gas cooking among staff and associates in cooking appliance departments is a significant issue and the Chefluencer Strategy Pilot learnings will be able to help us determine if a full-scale intervention can effectively address this barrier. If a similar intervention is implemented during Phase III, there will be an accompanying evaluation plan which the team will use for measuring its effectiveness.</p> <p>We agree that understanding what is offered during manufacturer training would be very interesting and we will investigate that. We can also ask whether the sales associates have received any training prior to the Chefluencer event (we can't assume they have), and the helpfulness of that training. Because we believe that sales staff are important influencers, we will add a deliverable to the pilot plan that includes a training for sales staff.</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
				<p>The budget for this pilot was not included in the original MTI Advancement Plan. CalMTA's 2024 ABAL included \$4.5 million in funding for program strategy testing pilots subject to CPUC Contract Manager approval follow review by MTAB and the public (see p. 5). Funding for the ESRPP Strategy Pilot was approved through this same process. Once CPUC approves this Cheflencer Strategy Pilot plan and the corresponding feedback response memo, it will release additional pilot funds for the Cheflencer Strategy Pilot.</p>
<p>Andre Saldivar, SCE's Foodservice Technology Center</p>	<p>11</p>	<p>Appliance Stores Vs. Box Stores</p>	<p>Store events/retail events- can these be identified for example an appliance store like Pacific Sales vs Box store like Lowes/Home Depot</p>	<p>Yes, once store partnerships are confirmed.</p>
<p>Andre Saldivar, SCE's Foodservice Technology Center</p>	<p>12</p>	<p>Audience tracking</p>	<p>How will they track the audience in a box store location? Most of the employees don't know what they have on floor and are not educated about the current products (gas and electric)</p>	<p>BDC plans to have several staff at the events and will be passing out information to attendees and survey information.</p> <p>Concerning staff, we are planning on conducting staff training before the event and this will provide the opportunity to learn about what the staff</p>

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
				know and how we can educate them on the current products.
Andre Saldivar, SCE's Foodservice Technology Center	13	Customer attention @ Appliance Store vs. Box Store	<p>Most people in an appliance store are going for an appliance vs the box store, how will they get their attention to be able show them a demo?</p> <p>Will have to educate those employees in that area of the box stores about the induction and get them comfortable to talk about it, vs sending the potential buyers to other common products.</p> <p>I think the big box retail is going to be a challenge in getting the attention of the potential buyers to learn about induction vs the dedicated appliance stores.</p>	<p>We will work with both retailer store managers and BDC on communications to attract customer attention. In past BDC events, they have often used the smell of cooking food to lure customers to the demonstrations area. We will also try to give away food samples pending food safety regulations. BDC will try this method along with other type of store communications.</p> <p>Regarding staff, please see comment above in #11.</p>
Andre Saldivar, SCE's Foodservice Technology Center	14	Putting Induction Stovetops in Model Homes	I believe the bigger influence or gain would be working with the home developers/builders in putting the Induction into the MODEL homes, where it can bring up discussion. If buyers are walking thru the model homes, then are looking to buy, with an Induction range there, it would be bring it up. Now they know they have an option. Most electric ready homes are still specifying electric coil ranges. The model homes have a suite of appliances	This is a good idea and we will consider this strategy with builders if this MTI advances to the next phase. CalMTA has spoken with others program administrators who run new construction programs for all-electric homes and the builders themselves are considered a barrier to inclusion of induction in new construction. These program administrators have recommended both Cheflencer events for builders themselves and then inclusion of

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
			there already and most have an Induction option.	<p>induction stoves in model homes. This could be an important strategy for the new construction market.</p> <p>This pilot primarily targets consumers in existing homes who are considering a kitchen upgrade or need to purchase a new stove. To accelerate the market for induction and reach all customers, both strategies will likely need to be deployed.</p>
PG&E	15	Training Staff on Induction	When training staff, the trainer should be completely honest with pluses and minuses about induction and myths around induction, as well. They should have talking points distributed to review.	Yes, we will be sure the events include a complete picture to consumers of the benefits and challenges for induction.
PG&E	16	Regions to Target	When selecting regions to target, consider outage frequencies in that area. Asking people to give up gas stove in an area that has experienced recent outages won't resonate.	We will look for data on areas of high power outages and avoid those areas.
PG&E	17	Diversity of Chefluencer Staff	recommend having more than one chef or at least support staff that represents, within reason, the diversity of the audience and that the presenters participate in the presentation equally.	Yes, this is in our plan. BDC has conducted events in multiple languages with chefs that specialize in several different kinds of cooking and will deploy a similar strategy in the retail stores. There will also be multiple staff present that can help facilitate the sessions both in English and Spanish.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
PG&E	18	Feedback Survey	recommend that survey be VERY short and that they use something like PollEverywhere or Slido so people can respond with their phones in the appropriate language.	Yes, we will plan for this.
PG&E	19	Summarize Cheflencer Events w/ Summary & Learnings	After the first two or three events, can implementer provide a summary of what they've learned and how that will inform future events?	Yes, we are planning on BDC completing a store memo after each event to summarize lessons learned so that we can apply those lessons to subsequent events.
PG&E	20	Leverage of Induction Loaner Programs	With induction cooking, seeing someone cook is good, but trying it for yourself is ideal. How can induction loaner programs be leveraged? PG&E is open to discussing opportunities with its loaner program.	Yes, we agree. Seeing is great but doing is likely even better. As mentioned above, we can gather information on loaner programs and pass this information out to participants. CalMTA is open to discussing with PG&E additional approaches to promoting the loaner programs.
PG&E	21	Two-Step Approach: Loaners & Incentives	consider a two-step approach. Can the program point people to the ICLP or provide them a single-hob unit and another incentive for the full stove?	CalMTA will explore this option with BDC and retailers.
PG&E	22	Store Staff Borrow Units	can store staff be asked or at least encouraged to take a unit home to try? Leverage existing on-demand training.	CalMTA will explore this option with BDC and retailers.
PG&E	23	Establish Data Approach / Key Activities	important to identify data collection expectations sooner than later. work backwards from what data needs to be analyzed?	The study results will be from a convenience sample of consumers who attend an event and choose to take part in the survey. We are planning on a minimum of 150 responses.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
				We will be able to gather insights from the consumer responses above, surveys completed by retailer staff, and interviews with store managers and national retail merchant staff.
PG&E	24	Key Deliverables	consider making a draft data collection plan or strategy a deliverable.	The data collection instrument is included as a deliverable in Task 5. We will add a draft version of this to Task 5 as well.
PG&E	25	Location of Chefluencer Programming	See prior notes about location. Location may determine foods cooked, languages spoken, chefs selected, and other program details.	Agreed. We will be careful to map the locations with the appropriate Chefluencer, language spoken, type of food included in the demonstration, and languages of supplemental materials distributed.
PG&E	26	Borrow Induction Equipment from PG&E	Can induction equipment be borrowed from PG&E ICLP or another program that has commercial units? PG&E is open to discussing these opportunities. We have higher end, but still 120v, commercial units.	This is an excellent opportunity and we will coordinate with PG&E ICLP staff.
PG&E	27	Determining retail & manufacturer partners for support marketing materials	PG&E is open to discussing providing existing materials.	This is an excellent opportunity and we will coordinate with PG&E ICLP staff.
PG&E	28	Loaner Programs	Consider leveraging existing loaner programs as a way of increasing uptake.	Agreed and, at a minimum, we will distribute information about local loaner programs at the appropriate store locations.

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
PG&E	29	Installation at Participating Stores	What does "installation" mean? Is the plan to use full-size induction stoves? if so, this will most likely require electrical work. Consider using high quality commercial 120V units.	In retail stores that don't already have a demonstration kitchen (some independents do have demonstration kitchens), we plan to utilize 120V plug in products.
PG&E	30	Choosing Sale Staff for Promotion	How will sales staff chosen/assigned to participate be chosen. Staff need to be enthusiastic and well-informed promoters for induction.	We will work with our retail partners and store managers on which staff to include in events.
PG&E	31	Displays set up days leading up to and after Chefluencer Demo	Is this enough lead time? Perhaps it's what's needed given budget and avoiding having to be on site two days. Can staff be asked to review a 15-20 minute video in advance so demo can be more focused? Perhaps a staff meeting can be a place for reviewing the pre-class materials.	Good ideas and we will work with BDC and the retailer store managers on implementation details.
PG&E	32	Program Implementer meet with PG&E ICLP Program Implementor	PG&E encourages implementer to meet with PG&E ICLP program implementer to learn about what borrowers have shared.	Yes, we welcome this and will schedule a meeting CalMTA, BDC, and PG&E ICLP staff.
PG&E	33	Preliminary Performance Metrics	Some bullet points below are tasks, and not metrics, per se.	Thank you for noting that; indeed some performance parameters are descriptive. Better wording would be "performance indicators" to broaden what we mean to convey here. We will update this in the Plan.
PG&E	34	Regional Diversity	glad to see mentioning of diversity. Tailor food, chef languages, materials, etc. to audience.	Yes, this is an important part of BDC's work and something we consider very

Source	Feedback #	Topic	Feedback Provided	CalMTA Response
				important for this pilot and any possible intervention in the future.
PG&E	35	Evaluation Research Objectives or Metrics	Only one of the bullets below appears to be a metric.	Yes, these are meant to be inclusive of objectives or metrics. Not all evaluation outcomes will be metrics.
PG&E	36	Customer Survey	will people be asked to fill out the survey twice? Or once and be asked to "think back" about how they felt?	We plan for participants to fill out one survey.